

THE APPLICATION OF COLLABORATIVE GOVERNMENT IN A CASE STUDY OF COOPERATION TO PROTECT MANGROVE FORESTS IN BENOA BAY BALI

Ferdiaz Syahputra Aryadi¹, Muhamad Rassya Putra²

^{1,2} International Relations, Universitas Pembangunan Nasional “Veteran” Jawa Timur
²prassya42@gmail.com

Keyword

*Collaborative Governance, Reclamation
, Mangrove Planting Cooperation*

Abstract

The reclamation action carried out by PT Pelindo in Benoa Bay, Bali has made some of the surrounding mangrove ecosystems experience natural damage. The purpose of this study is to determine whether collaboration in planting mangrove seedlings at Mangrove Arboretum Park is good Collaborative Governance. The method used is literature with a qualitative approach. The data sources used are secondary data such as journals, news, and the web. The data findings were then analyzed using the theory of Collaborative Governance by Nasrulhaq (2020) with indicators including consensus orientation, collective leadership, multi-directional communication, and resource sharing. The results of this study explain that every layer of society contributes to the success of a joint action by involving the Balinese government, social communities such as Mangrove Rangers, and civil society such as Balinese students in the mangrove seedling planting movement at Mangrove Arboretum Park, Pedungan, Denpasar. The action and cooperation is a form of Collaborative Governance in overcoming the problem of mangrove forest reclamation in Benoa Bay, Bali.

INTRODUCTION

Benoa Bay is a bay located in the southern part of Bali Island, Indonesia with an area of approximately 1400 hectares. Benoa Bay plays an important role in the economic, social and cultural life of the people on the island of Bali. The bay has a rich and diverse ecosystem, including seagrass beds, coral reefs and mangrove forests. Mangrove forest is one of the important components of the continental bay which has an area of about 1,394.5 hectares. This area represents 62.9% of the total mangrove forest area on the island of Bali (Iqbal, 2022). Mangrove forests in Benoa Bay provide socio-economic benefits for the local community, namely as a source of livelihoods such as fishermen, craftsmen and ecotourism managers, thereby increasing the economic value of the local community. Furthermore, mangrove forests also have an important role for the surrounding environment, namely as coastal protection, habitat for flora and fauna species, carbon sinks and decomposers of waste and water pollutants before heading to the open sea (Rani Hafsaridewi, 2020). The strong roots of mangroves help in stabilizing the soil so as to prevent erosion and abrasion in coastal bays. Mangroves also provide shelter, breeding grounds and food sources for several species of animals such as fish, birds and other marine organisms. This has the effect of increasing biodiversity and biodiversity in the region. However, recently, the survival of the mangrove ecosystem in Benoa Bay has faced a major threat, namely the reclamation project proposed by PT Pelabuhan Indonesia (Pelindo). The reclamation project aims to develop the port as well as the economic and trade center (Gokkon, 2019). This is due to the strategic location of Benoa Bay, which has been a busy route of cultural interaction and trade since the 19th century.

These reclamation plans and projects are increasingly having a negative impact on the mangrove ecosystem and coral reefs in Benoa Bay. Additionally, the impact of the destruction of mangrove ecosystems and coral reefs can be harmful to the surrounding communities who make a living there. According to Iqbal (2022), the harmful impacts of reclamation that lead to the destruction of mangrove ecosystems and coral reefs are the disruption of the economy of fishermen, the reduction of the function of Benoa Bay as a watershed, and Benoa Bay becoming more vulnerable to abrasion. The implementation of this project has increasingly become a target for community rejection due to the harmful impacts it brings. This community rejection was also supported by the governor of Bali in 2019. Quoted from Mongabay (2019), an environmental news website, the Governor of Bali at the time, Wayan Koster, sent a letter to Pelindo to stop the reclamation of Benoa Harbour expansion. This letter was written after reports of violations and the consequences of the reclamation of marine areas that caused damage to the 17-hectare mangrove ecosystem. In his letter, the Bali Governor also requested a review of the Benoa Port Development Master Plan (RIP) to pay more attention to the arrangement in accordance with the vision of "Nangun Sat Kerthi Loka Bali" which means "maintaining the sanctity and harmony of Bali's nature" (Dinas Pendidikan, Kebudayaan dan Olahraga Provinsi Bali, n.d.). Meanwhile, the reported violation is Pelindo III's negligence in handling sedimentation, where according to the plan, an embankment or slit screen should be built. However, in the facts on the ground, the construction of embankments and slit screens was not carried out, resulting in the death of most mangrove plants due to sedimentation that accumulated in the roots of mangrove trees (Mongabay, 2019). Mentioned by I Nyoman Serakat, Head of UPT Tahura Ngurah Rai, Pelindo III who is responsible for this damage promised and has planted around 50 thousand mangrove trees and claimed 95% of the seeds will grow to a height of around 50 cm (Mongabay, 2019).

There is a tangible form of collaboration between the government and private institutions and the community manifested in the mangrove planting movement in a series of commemorations of World Environment Day 2024 on 5 June 2024. This collaboration in an effort to preserve mangrove forests is centered on the Mangrove Arboretum Park located in Pedungan, South Denpasar, which is adjacent to Benoa Harbour and directly overlooks the waters of Benoa Bay. According to Nyoman Sweet Juniartini from Sahabat Mangrove Ranger, the Mangrove Arboretum Park has suffered massive damage, with around 12 hectares of mangrove trees that make up the Mangrove Arboretum Park having been destroyed (TimesIndonesia). According to the current Governor of Bali, Sang Made Mahendra Jaya, the condition of the Mangrove Arboretum Park after replanting has improved compared to the condition in 2018. The success achieved in the preservation and planting of mangroves in Mangrove Arboretum Park certainly requires synergised cooperation between the community and other institutions. In cooperation in the preservation of mangrove forests in Mangrove Arboretum Park, there are three actors involved in mangrove preservation cooperation in Mangrove Arboretum Park. These actors are the Governor of Bali, Sahabat Mangrove Ranger, and Students and Communities. Good cooperation between these actors also has a high influence on the success of mangrove conservation efforts in Benoa Bay, especially Mangrove Arboretum Park. According to Nasrulhaq (2020), formal, explicit, and collectively oriented cooperation is described as collaboration. Cooperation in conservation efforts is certainly not a simple thing. Cooperation between actors in solving a common issue, namely the natural destruction of Benoa Bay, is one form of complex inter-actor relations in a public policy. The collaborative relationship between actors eventually gave birth to the concept of Collaborative Government, which is a process and structure that involves various parties that cross their organizational boundaries (Nasrulhaq, 2020). Mentioned by Nasrulhaq (2020), good Collaborative Governance can also be realized if the basic values of Collaborative Governance are fulfilled so that the cooperation in question can become an integrated unit at every stage of public policy.

Based on the above problems, researchers are interested in examining the collaboration that has been carried out by the actors involved. So that the researcher formulates the research problem formulation, namely "Is Collaboration in Planting Mangrove Seedlings at Mangrove Arboretum Park carried out by the Bali Regional Government with Sahabat Mangrove Rangers

and the Community is a form of good Collaborative Government?". Firstly, in this study, researchers used Verdinand Robertua's 2013 research entitled "The Reconstruction of Indonesia's Mangrove Diplomacy" as a literature review. Verdinand Robertua's research shows that the Tanjung Benoa reclamation plan in Bali raises serious questions about Indonesia's mangrove diplomacy. Based on his research, the success of mangrove conservation can only be realized if there is cooperation between actors in the Pyramid Structure of Indonesia's Mangrove Foreign Policy. The Pyramid Structure of Indonesian Mangrove Foreign Policy itself consists of Mangrove Diplomacy as the highest, then the President and the Government of Indonesia in the second position, and the Local Government and the community are in the lowest position. In this study, researchers focused on the bottom structure, namely the role and cooperation of actors involved in the lowest or local position, namely the Governor of Bali as the Regional Government and the Sahabat Mangrove Ranger and the community as part of Civil Society.

Secondly, in this study, researchers used the theory presented by Nasrulhaq, namely "Basic Values of Collaborative Governance in Public Policy Studies" in 2020. In his theory, Nasrulhaq (2020) examines the basic values of collaborative governance based on theoretical studies and empirical facts. Nasrulhaq (2020) states that collaboration is different from networks and partnerships, where collaboration has its own basic values. Mentioned by Ansell and Gash (2008) in Nasrulhaq (2020), networks are used to describe forms of cooperation whose scope is more plural, informal, and implicit. There are also partnerships that describe cooperation that is oriented towards coordination rather than consensus in decision-making. Meanwhile, in contrast to the others, collaboration describes cooperation that is more formal, explicit, and collectively oriented in decision-making. It is mentioned by Bevir (2009) that partnership can occur when private agents more or less replace public roles, while collaboration can occur when public and private agents perform active functions collectively (Nasrulhaq, 2020). Nasrulhaq in his theory argues that Collaborative Governance as a form of new public governance has basic values that characterize good collaboration. In addition, these basic values are also a reference for whether the phenomenon that occurs is a phenomenon that takes the form of collaborative governance or not.

The basic values of collaborative governance proposed by Nasrulhaq (2020), namely:

1. Consensus-orientation

Consensus, according to the Big Indonesian Dictionary, is an agreement of words or a consensus reached through unanimity. According to Nasrulhaq (2020), consensus is upheld because the main picture of collaboration is mutual agreement. The action taken starts with one determination and one goal so that the interests of each individual or organization accumulate into a common interest. Meanwhile, according to Ansell and Gash (2008), the criteria for collaboration is consensus where the agreement is based on common interests. Consensus is important because governance describes the interaction between two or more parties.

2. Collective Leadership

Leadership in collaboration is geared towards a collective model. The presence of a leader or coordinator is still encouraged, especially to facilitate coordination and direction. This value is based on the understanding that the core of management and governance is leadership. However, in collaboration, mutual coordination is a very important point because leadership in collaboration is in the form of a network so that all individuals are essentially in the same position. As such, the value of togetherness is given the highest priority in collaboration. This also makes the leader or coordinator at least the center of the public policy stage to know the progress, results, and impact and can facilitate direction.

3. Multi-directional Communication

Multi-directional communication refers to the existence of ongoing feedback involving more than two parties that takes place on an ongoing basis with high intensity. This includes responses and responses are made to all parties involved with a variety of

ways of communicating. Multidirectional communication is argued to be one of the core processes in collaboration (Ansell and Gash, 2008).

4. Resource Sharing

The resources in question are human resources and financial resources as well as other resources that can strengthen collaboration activities in public policy. Emerson et al (2012) in Nasrulhaq (2020), place resources as part of the capacity variable of a collaboration. Collaboration capacity can also be measured based on the extent to which resources are shared and shared. The hope is that by sharing resources, each collaborator can strengthen each other's strengths and cover deficiencies and be equally active.

METHOD

The research method used is a qualitative approach using library research. The data used in the research is secondary data. Secondary data is data that has been previously collected and reported by people or agencies outside of their own research, although what is collected is actually original data. Secondary data can be obtained from agencies, libraries, or from other parties (Tika, 2006). Secondary data in this study were obtained from literature studies such as public policies, journals, theses, news, web, and other data so that the data collected became relevant. The subjects of the research include the Balinese government, Sahabat Mangrove Ranger, and students and the community, while the object of the research is the Mangrove Forest at Mangrove Arboretum Park. The preparation of the article begins with the collection and analysis of data related to collaborative governance in public policy studies from several literatures listed in the bibliography or references. After that, the data that has been collected is processed to be presented in narrative form.

RESULTS

Based on literature studies that have been conducted by researchers, researchers have collected data related to collaborative governance between actors in the preservation of mangrove ecosystems in Benoa Bay Bali which have been grouped based on four indicators or basic values that have been put forward by Nasrulhaq (2020) in the form of: Consensus Orientation, Collective Leadership, Multi-directional Communication, and Resource Sharing.

1. Consensus-orientation

Based on the research findings, researchers found the orientation or goals of the actors in conserving mangrove forests in Benoa Bay. Starting from one of the actors, the Bali Government, represented by Bali Governor Sang Made Mahendra Jaya, replacing Wayan Koster, who has a goal to realize the vision of "Nangun Sat Kerthi Loka Bali" which means "maintaining the sanctity and harmony of Bali's nature" (Mongabay, 2019). The vision of "Nangun Sat Kerthi Loka Bali" upheld by the Bali Regional Government illustrates the government's goal to preserve the mangrove forests and coral reefs in Bali's Benoa Bay. This desire is also reinforced by Former Governor Wayan Koster's efforts in sending a letter to PT Pelindo to stop the reclamation of the dumping I and dumping II areas because reclamation in this area threatens the preservation of mangrove forests in Benoa Bay. Governor Wayan Koster also hopes that the status of the Benoa Bay area will return to a conservation area and mangrove forest conservation area (Assumption, 2021). The conservation efforts by Wayan Koster were continued by Governor Sang Made Mahendra Jaya, as the incumbent since 2023, by planting mangrove seedlings at the Mangrove Arboretum Park.

The second actor in planting mangrove seedlings at Mangrove Arboretum Park is Sahabat Mangrove Ranger. This community is one of the communities that has played an active role in conserving mangrove forests in Indonesia and Bali since 2023. Reviewing the condition of mangrove damage at Mangrove Arboretum Park, Sahabat Mangrove Ranger has collaborated with the Bali government to take part in the mangrove seedling planting programme in Benoa Bay, one of which is at Mangrove Arboretum Park. The Sahabat

Mangrove Ranger community itself has a goal to preserve the mangrove ecosystem in accordance with their vision, namely, "Initiating and supporting afforestation and reforestation programs to create healthy and beneficial coastal ecosystems and participate in adaptation and mitigation of climate change and global warming" (Artiyanto, 2024).

The third actors in planting mangrove seedlings at Mangrove Arboretum Park are students and Balinese people. Balinese people responded negatively to the reclamation carried out by PT Pelindo III. Balinese people consider that the reclamation of Benoa Bay has destroyed traditional and religious values (Mongabay, 2016). Additionally, the Balinese also rejected the reclamation project because it has damaged the environment and disrupted the livelihoods of fishermen. This is implied in the statement of the Secretary General of the People's Coalition for Fisheries Justice (KIARA), Susan Herawati, who suggested that the government re-study the reasons why Balinese people reject reclamation projects. Susan emphasized that the government should not only pay attention to the people, but also to the fishermen who will be affected by the reclamation project. (Mongabay, 2018).

2. Collective Leadership

The Bali provincial government's action in implementing mangrove planting as a celebration of World Environment Day 2024 led and coordinated directly by the Governor of Bali Province is an effort to conserve mangrove forests in Benoa Bay. This activity was held on 5 June 2024, centered on the Mangrove Arboretum Park and was attended by hundreds of participants such as the Governor's Office together with the Regional Secretary of Bali Province, Sahabat Mangrove Ranger, Green Ambassador, environmental activists, students and media crews (Artiyanto, 2024). Of the hundreds of participants who attended, the Governor of the Bali Government was trusted to lead the series of activities. Sang Made Mahendra Jaya as the Governor of Bali expressed his gratitude to all participants who have contributed to protecting the earth and emphasized that all parties have a responsibility to protect nature.

3. Multi-directional Communication

Collaboration between actors in planting mangrove seedlings at Mangrove Arboretum Park involves intense and continuous communication. Interactions between actors also show a future-orientated vision. Dewa Made Indra as Bali's regional secretary said that the planting of mangrove seedlings will stop for a while but conservation efforts will continue until the Mangrove Arboretum Park area becomes green and beautiful again (Muliantar, 2024). Dewa Made Indra also added that the Mangrove Arboretum Park was designed by the Balinese government as an educational and research area, hence the rehabilitation and arrangement of plants. Of the 25 hectares of total land area, 12 hectares have been rehabilitated and 3 hectares of mangrove plants are arranged for each type. Representative of Sahabat Mangrove Ranger, Nyoman Sweet Juniartini, who is involved in this collaboration also added that there will be another mapping simultaneously because there are several areas that can still be planted with mangroves.

4. Resource Sharing

Human resources are one of the important components for the success of a collaboration. The action of planting 500 mangroves at Mangrove Arboretum Park can be achieved with the involvement of cooperation from various parties between the Balinese government, the community, and the community. In this case, the Bali government as the organizer of the action also participated directly with the involvement of the Governor of Bali and several OPDs of the Bali Provincial Government. From the community, Mangrove Ranger sent its members and the community such as Balinese students and the surrounding community also helped in the action (Artiyanto, 2024).

DISCUSSION

The planting of mangrove tree seedlings at Mangrove Arboretum Park is a form of cooperation between the government, the community, and the public in an effort to preserve the

mangrove ecosystem in Benoa Bay. It is also a form of collaboration that is formal, explicit, and collectively oriented towards a common goal. To answer the formulation of the problem, the researcher will analyze the findings with the theory of the basic values of Collaborative Governance proposed by Nasrulhaq (2020) to determine whether cooperation in planting mangrove tree seedlings at Mangrove Arboretum Park is a good Collaborative Governance phenomenon or not.

The collaboration between the Balinese government with Mangrove Rangers and the Balinese people, especially students, is established to achieve a common goal, namely preserving the environment and nature of Bali. Although the findings show that there are differences in vision between actors, where the Bali Government is trying to realize the vision of "Nangun Sat Kerthi Loka Bali" while Sahabat Mangrove Ranger has a vision of "Initiating and supporting afforestation and reforestation programs to create healthy and beneficial coastal ecosystems and participate in adaptation and mitigation of climate change and global warming", the goals and consensus orientation of each actor refer to one goal, namely the preservation of Bali's environment and nature. This is also in line with the goals of the community, especially indigenous people who consider the preservation of the Benoa Bay environment to be part of their customs.

The Balinese government in this cooperation successfully led the Mangrove Rangers and the community to achieve the same goal as the collective leader. The Balinese government, represented by Governor Sang Made Mahendra Jaya, managed to become a collectively approved figure as a leader in this collaboration. Governor Sang Made Mahendra Jaya also succeeded in managing the cooperation of each actor involved so that the goal of planting mangrove seedlings in Mangrove Arboretum Park on 5 June 2024 could be achieved which was marked by the successful planting of 500 mangrove seedlings.

Communication carried out in this collaboration also runs very well. The Bali government together with the Mangrove Ranger, who has a higher capacity than the community, are increasingly active in planning the next seedling planting activity. Communication between these two actors to the community was also good so that the Bali Government and Mangrove Ranger were able to mobilize a number of communities to get involved in planting activities. All actors involved in this collaborative partnership also share resources equally. Each actor has their own role in this collaboration. In this case, the Bali Regional Government, Mangrove Ranger, and the Balinese community each send resources in the form of human resources who work together in planting seedlings.

CONCLUSION

The collaboration between the Bali Regional Government with Mangrove Rangers and the Balinese community in planting mangrove seedlings in the Mangrove Arboretum Park area is one form of good collaborative cooperation. The cooperation established in the success of this activity, fulfills the indicators or has the values mentioned by Nasrulhaq (2020) to be called collaborative cooperation. The findings in this study also concluded that, based on Nasrulhaq (2020), the collaboration between the Bali Regional Government with Mangrove Rangers and the Balinese community is a form of Collaborative Governance in overcoming problems among the community where there is resistance to reclamation and natural damage that continues to occur. This collaboration not only shows collaborative cooperation and good collaborative governance, but also shows the real action of the Bali Regional Government and the Mangrove Ranger community in realizing a common vision and goal of creating a sustainable environment and nature.

REFERENCES

- Ansel, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 543-571.
- Artiyanto, S. (2024, May 31). *12 Hektar di Kawasan Mangrove Arboretum Park, Pedungan Denpasar Almi Kerusakan, ini Pesan Pj Gubernur Bali*. Retrieved from TimesIndonesia:

- <https://timesindonesia.co.id/peristiwa-daerah/497539/12-hektar-di-kawasan-mangrove-arboretum-park-pedungan-denpasar-almi-kerusakan-ini-pesan-pj-gubernur-bali>
- Barometer Bali. (2022, July 29). *Pelindo III Ternyata Reklamasi Laut dan Berencana Potong Terumbu Karang*. Retrieved from BarometerBali: <https://barometerbali.com/2022/07/29/pelindo-iii-ternyata-reklamasi-perairan-sekitar-teluk-benoa/>
- Bevir, M. (2009). *Key Concepts in Governance*. Sage Publication.
- Dinas Pendidikan Kepemudaan dan Olahraga Provisi Bali. (n.d.). *Nangun Sat Kerthi Loka Bali*. Retrieved from Dinas Pendidikan Kepemudaan dan Olahraga Provisi Bali: <https://disdikpora.baliprov.go.id/nangun-sat-kerthi-loka-bali/>
- Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An Integrated Framework for Collaborative Governance. *Journal of Administration Research and Theory*, 1-29.
- Gokkon, B. (2019, October 11). *Bali mangrove bay is now a conservation zone, nixing reclamation plan*. Retrieved from Mongabay: <https://news.mongabay.com/2019/10/bali-benoa-bay-mangroves-conservation-reclamation/>
- Iqbal, M. (2022, October 14). *Mangrove Teluk Benoa Bali, Semangat Menjaga Kelestarian Alamnya*. Retrieved from Lindungihutan: <https://lindungihutan.com/blog/teluk-benoa-yang-hijau-kembali/>
- Muhajir, A. (2014, September 23). *Nasib Miris Hutan Mangrove Teluk Benoa*. Retrieved from Mongabay: Situs Berita Lingkungan: <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2014/09/23/nasib-miris-hutan-mangrove-teluk-benoa/>
- Muliantari, N. P. (2024, May 31). *Pemprov Bali dan para pelajar tanam 500 bibit bakau di Arboretum Park*. Retrieved from Antara Bali: <https://bali.antaranews.com/berita/346416/pemprov-bali-dan-para-pelajar-tanam-500-bibit-bakau-di-arboretum-park>
- Nasrulhaq. (2020). Nilai Dasar Collaborative Government. *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 396-401.
- Rani Hafsaridewi, D. P. (2020, Mei 06). *Mangrove dan Mata Pencaharian Masyarakat*. Retrieved from Pojok Iklim: <http://pojokiklim.menlhk.go.id/read/mangrove-dan-mata-pencaharian-masyarakat>
- Robertua, V. (2013). 171The Reconstruction of Indonesia's Mangrove Diplomacy. *Global Strategis*, 171-183.
- Suriyani, L. D. (2019, March 9). *Areal Tahura Mangrove Rusak Karena Reklamasi Pelindo, Bagaimana Penegakan Hukumnya? [Bagian 2]*. Retrieved from Mongabay: <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2019/03/09/areal-tahura-mangrove-rusak-karena-reklamasi-pelindo-bagaimana-penegakan-hukumnya-bagian-2/>
- Suriyani, L. D. (2019, September 13). *Setelah Reklamasi Pelabuhan Benoa Berhenti, Bagaimana Rehabilitasi Mangrove Kini?* Retrieved from Mongabay: Situs Berita Lingkungan: <https://www.mongabay.co.id/2019/09/13/setelah-reklamasi-pelabuhan-benoa-berhenti-bagaimana-rehabilitasi-mangrove-kini/>
- Tika, M. P. (2006). *Moh. Pabundu Tika*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
- Wiguna, D. S. (2023, October 25). *Pelindo bangun IPAL pengembangan Pelabuhan Benoa Bali 2025-2030*. Retrieved from Antara: <https://www.antaranews.com/berita/3791322/pelindo-bangun-ipal-pengembangan-pelabuhan-benoa-bali-2025-2030>